

# Minutes



Listening Learning Leading

OF A MEETING OF THE

## Planning Committee

HELD AT 6.00PM ON 22 OCTOBER 2008

AT COUNCIL OFFICES, CROWMARSH GIFFORD

### Present:

Mrs P Slatter (Chairman)

Mr G Andrews, Ms J Bland, Mr F Bloomfield, Mr D Bretherton, Mr P Cross, Mr C Daukes (as substitute for Mr A Rooke), Mr D Dodds (as substitute for Capt J Flood), Mrs E Gillespie, Mr A Hodgson, Mr I Lokhon, Mrs A Midwinter, Mr R Peasgood, Mr R Peirce, Mrs M Turner

### Apologies:

Capt J Flood and Mr A Rooke tendered apologies.

### Officers:

Mr R Cramp, Mrs S Crawford, Mr A Duffield, Mrs K Fiander, Mrs K Gould, Mr P Lucas, Ms S Mangion, Miss J Randle

### 67. Minutes 1 October and 8 October 2008

**RESOLVED:** to approve the minutes of the meetings held on 1 October and 8 October 2008 as correct records and to agree that the Chairman sign them.

### 68. Proposals for site visits

On being made aware of the proposal to carry out a site visit to a property in her ward, Mrs P Slatter, a ward councillor, stepped down from the committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

Mr F Bloomfield acted as chairman for this item.

A site visit to 16-19 Summerfield Rise, Goring (application P08/W0859/O) was proposed to assess the impact of the development upon the distinctiveness of the local area. On being seconded and put to the vote, the motion was declared carried.

**RESOLVED:** to carry out a site visit to 16-19 Summerfield Rise, Goring (application P08/W0859/O) to assess the impact of the development upon the distinctiveness of the local area.

## **69. P08/W0716, 115 Southend, Garsington**

Mrs P Slatter resumed the role of chairman for the remainder of the meeting.

Mrs E Gillespie, ward councillor, stepped down from the committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The committee considered an application for full planning permission to demolish the existing bungalow and to construct a replacement dwelling at 115 Southend, Garsington.

Mr C Wright and Mr G Russell, representatives of Garsington Parish Council, addressed the committee in support of this application.

Mr A Carter and Mrs S Opher, objectors, addressed the committee objecting to the application.

Mr R Painter and Mr M Orr, agents, addressed the committee in support of the application.

Mrs E Gillespie, ward councillor, addressed the committee on this application.

A motion, moved and seconded, to refuse planning permission, on being put was declared carried.

**RESOLVED:** to refuse planning permission for application P08/W0716, 115 Southend, Garsington, for the following reasons:

1. That, having regard to the scale, mass and design of the proposed development, in particular its width, depth and degree of excavation, the new dwelling would be overly prominent in the street scene and visually intrusive in this edge of settlement location contrary to policies G2, G6, D1 and H5 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan.
2. That, having regard to the scale and mass of the proposed dwelling in relation to the modest neighbouring property at number 113 Southend, the development will result in an oppressive and incongruous form of development contrary to policies G2, G6 and H5 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan.
3. That, having regard to the excessive depth of the proposed dwelling on the very edge of the settlement, the development

would harm the openness of the Oxford Green Belt contrary to policies G2 ,GB2 and GB4.

## **70. P08/W0978/RET, Holton House, Holton**

The Planning Officer reported an amendment to the report at paragraph 4.2, which should state that *three* (not two) objections had been received. The objector's comments were in accordance with those of the two objectors, as reported.

The committee considered a retrospective application to alter and improve existing outbuildings for purposes incidental/ancillary at Holton House, Holton (part retrospective).

Ms C Hulse and Mr Cogan, objectors, addressed the committee objecting to the application.

Mr D Hignell and Mr G Cox, agent and applicant, addressed the committee in support of the application.

A motion, moved and seconded, to grant planning permission, on being put was declared carried.

An amendment to the motion, moved and seconded, to add a condition for removal of all skylights was withdrawn without debate.

On wishing for a debate on the withdrawn amendment, the amendment to add a condition for removal of all skylights was again moved and seconded. On putting the amendment to the vote, it was declared lost.

**RESOLVED:** to grant planning permission for application P08/W0978/RET, Holton House, Holton, subject to the following conditions:

1. That the building shall be occupied and used only for purposes incidental to the use of Holton House as a single dwellinghouse and not as a separate self-contained dwelling or for commercial purposes.
2. That the materials to be used for the external walls and roofs shall be of the same colour, type, texture as those used on the existing building.
3. That the building shall not be occupied or used until a detailed specification of the type, design and external finish of all windows and external doors has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and the features maintained as such thereafter.

4. That notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development)(Amendment) (No.2) (England) Order 2008 (or any Order revoking or re-enacting that Order) no external improvements or alterations, including the provision of additional rooflights, window or door openings shall be carried out to the building hereby approved without the prior written permission of the Local Planning Authority.

## **71. P08/W0535/RM, 41 Manor Drive, Horspath**

Mr A Hodgson, a ward councillor, stepped down from the committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The committee considered an application, as amended, seeking reserved matters approval to erect two dwellings (one two-bedroom unit with attached garage and one four-bedroom house with attached garage) at 41 Manor Drive, Horspath.

The Planning Officer advised that, although she had intended to provide an update on the consultation with Oxfordshire County Council Highways, she had not received comment from them.

Ms S Woodcock, a representative of Horspath Parish Council, addressed the committee objecting to the application.

Mr D Horsley, objector, addressed the committee objecting to the application.

Mr H Venners and Mr M Green, agent and applicant, addressed the committee in support of this application.

Mr A Hodgson, a ward councillor, addressed the committee on this item.

A motion, moved and seconded, to grant planning permission, on being put was declared carried.

**RESOLVED:** to grant planning permission for application P08/W0535/RM, 41 Manor Drive, Horspath, subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years - full planning permission
2. Sample materials required (walls and roof)
3. Windows and external doors to specification
4. Tree protection (detailed)
5. Sustainable homes - code level 3
6. Landscaping
7. Hours of construction
8. No additional windows, doors or other openings.

## **72. P08/W0848/RET, The Triangle adjacent to A418 and A40 Wheatley (parish of Great Milton)**

On becoming aware of his association with one of the applicants, Mr A Hodgson, declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item. In accordance with the provisions in the councillors' code of conduct, he stepped down from the committee and withdrew from the room during the committee's consideration of and voting on the item.

The committee considered a retrospective application seeking planning permission for the retention of earth bunds, which had been constructed along the western boundary of the site at The Triangle adjacent to the A418 and A40 Wheatley in the parish of Great Milton.

The Planning Officer detailed an amendment to the report at paragraph 3.2 which should read "A better solution could be achieved with improvements to the fencing and additional *planting*".

Mr M Tyce, a representative of Waterstock Parish Council, addressed the committee on this item objecting to the application.

Mr H Venners, agent, addressed the committee in support of the application.

A motion, moved and seconded, to refuse planning permission in line with the officer's recommendations, on being put was declared lost.

Despite the officer's recommendation for refusal, some councillors supported the view that the bunds were a green-belt answer to the problems experienced at the site and were in keeping with the embankments at the nearby A418. For these reasons, a motion to grant planning permission, amended to defer consideration of the report to allow a fuller background report with comment from Oxfordshire County Council, on being moved, seconded and put to the vote, was declared carried.

**RESOLVED:** to defer consider application P08/W0848/RET, The Triangle adjacent to A418 and A40 Wheatley (parish of Great Milton) to allow for a fuller background report with comment from Oxfordshire County Council.

## **73. P08/E0995, 32 Milton Close, Henley-on-Thames**

Ms J Bland, ward councillor, stepped down from the committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The committee considered an application seeking full planning permission to erect a two-storey three bedroom dwelling attached to the western side wall and a two-storey rear extension to the existing dwelling at 32 Milton Close, Henley-on-Thames.

Mr T Buckett, a representative of Henley Town Council, addressed the committee objecting to this application.

Mr B J Tindall, applicant, addressed the committee in support of the application.

A motion, moved and seconded, to grant planning permission, on being put was declared carried.

**RESOLVED:** to grant planning permission for application P08/E0995, 32 Milton Close, Henley-on-Thames, subject to the following conditions:

1. Standard three year time limit
2. Dwelling and extension to be constructed simultaneously
3. Details of slab levels prior to commencement
4. Samples of materials new dwelling and extension prior to commencement
5. Hardstanding to be constructed from porous materials
6. First floor windows west elevation of new dwelling to be obscure glazed
7. Removal of permitted development rights for new dwelling for windows, extensions, porch, outbuildings, hardstandings
8. Removal of permitted development rights for first floor side windows to east elevation of extension
9. Details of finalised sustainability measures for new dwelling having regard to level 1 of code for sustainable homes prior to commencement
10. Revised details of refuse, recycling and composting facilities to be agreed prior to commencement
11. Formation of new access and visibility splays for proposed dwelling prior to commencement and retained as such
12. Parking spaces and cycle storage to be provided prior to occupation and retained as such
13. Details of hard and soft landscaping prior to commencement
14. Details of contamination investigation and mitigation as necessary prior to commencement.

#### **74. P08/W1033, Manor Cottage, High Street, Ewelme**

Mr F Bloomfield, a ward councillor, stepped down from the committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The committee considered an application seeking planning permission for the conversion of the existing cottage into two one-bedroom flats at Manor Cottage, High Street, Ewelme.

Mr A Robson, agent, addressed the committee in support of the application.

Mr F Bloomfield, a ward councillor, addressed the committee on this application.

A motion, moved and seconded, to refuse planning permission, on being put was declared carried.

**RESOLVED:** to refuse planning permission for application P08/W1033, Manor Cottage, High Street, Ewelme, for the following reasons:

1. The existing cottage makes a positive contribution to the character of the conservation area in terms of its traditional style, use of materials and setting. The introduction of dormers in the currently unbroken north west roof slope to replace the existing dormers in the south east elevation will disrupt the clearly defined character of the building and neither preserves nor enhances the character and appearance of the Ewelme conservation area. As such the proposal is contrary to Policies G2 and CON7 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan.
2. The existing dormers and consented scheme for the subdivision of the building to provide two flats (P07/W1473) make better use of passive solar gain providing more light and heat than would be gained by windows in the north west elevation. As such the proposal is contrary to Policy D8 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan and advice in the South Oxfordshire Design Guide.

The meeting closed at 8.35 pm.

Chairman

Date